

Public Conveniences Summary Report, October 2014

Introduction

This report provides a summary of the current Public Conveniences service, including employee, premises and transport costs. Further analysis is being carried out with a view to establishing different options for savings within the service budget. One and three year plans will be drawn up that will address the two potential outcomes of the Council's budget consultation process for Public Conveniences. This will ensure that strategies are in place and can be utilised in the event of a £300,000 or £600,000 loss from the service budget. These plans will be drafted by the end of December 2014.

It must be noted that budget savings, particularly those from the employee budget, will not become immediately available within the 2015/2016 financial year. Redeployment of staff into other suitable posts will take place when roles become available.

Discussions are ongoing with Essential Edinburgh Business Improvement District with regards the future of the two APT's currently located within St Andrew Square. There is potential for a partnership with the Council around the management of these facilities going forward. Discussions have also taken place with Greater Grassmarket Business Improvement District about the APT in the Grassmarket area, but it is unlikely that the BID would be able accommodate the management of this facility in the future.

Main report

1.1 Summary of initial review of toilet facilities

The table overleaf summarises the review of currently available toilet facilities that took place on 15 October 2014. The discussion produced the following initial figures:

- Number of facilities to remain open (including the refurbished city
- centre toilets): **Ten**

- Number of facilities to close: **Ten**
- Number of facilities that could be retained, depending on contribution from Lothian Buses: **Four**
- Number of facilities where a decision was not made: **Five**

| Public Convenience | Location | Keep/ Close | Comments |
|--------------------|-----------------------|---|---|
| Ardmillan | 1/01 Gorgie Road | Close | Peak usage related to football matches at nearby Tynecastle Stadium. Requires significant investment (at least £77k). |
| Bath Street | 4/1 Bath Street | ? | Close to Portobello Swim Centre, Leisure and Indoor Bowls Centre, Arcades. Discussion needed around potential for refurbished toilets to replace existing poor quality ones. |
| Bruntsfield | 99 Bruntsfield Place | Keep | No nearby alternative facilities. |
| Canaan Lane | 7 Canaan Lane | Close | Close to Morningside Library. |
| Canonmills | 32 Brandon Terrace | Close (dependent on Lothian Buses response) | User figures expected to be greatly affected by number of bus drivers using this facility. Propose that Lothian Buses provide contribution to keep these facilities open. |
| Castle Terrace | 38/2 Castle Terrace | Keep | Facility was refurbished in 2013. |
| Castlehill | 386 Castlehill | Keep | Facility was refurbished in 2013. |
| Colinton | 300A Colinton Road | Keep (dependent on Lothian Buses response) | In very good condition. User numbers expected to be greatly affected by bus drivers using this facility. Propose that Lothian Buses provide contribution to keep these facilities open. |
| Cramond | 33 Cramond Glebe Road | Keep | No nearby alternative facilities. |

| Public Convenience | Location | Keep/ Close | Comments |
|--------------------------------|------------------------------------|---|---|
| Currie | 211 Lanark Road West | Close | Very poor condition. In close proximity to Currie Library, this could be promoted to the public. |
| Granton Square | 9 Granton Square | Close (dependent on Lothian Buses response) | High usage figures that are likely to be the result of bus drivers and taxi drivers using this facility. Propose that Lothian Buses provide contribution to keep these facilities open. |
| Hamilton Place | 5 – 7 Hamilton Place | Keep | If Canonmills facility is closed, then this would be the remaining facility in the area. |
| Hawes Pier, South Queensferry | Hawes Brae Pier | Close | Poor condition and signage. Discussion needed around potential for refurbished toilets to replace existing poor quality ones. |
| High Street, South Queensferry | 36B High Street, South Queensferry | Close | Poor condition and signage. Discussion needed around potential for refurbished toilets to replace existing poor quality ones. |
| Hope Park | 11/1 Hope Park Crescent | Keep | Close proximity to very busy play area (largest in Edinburgh) and situated in a primarily residential area. |
| Hunter Square | 11 Hunter Square | Close | To be closed in 2016 as part of the new Tron lease with Edinburgh World Heritage. In close proximity to Waverley Station, NMS. |
| Public Convenience | Location | Keep/ Close | Comments |

| | | | |
|---------------------------|-------------------------------|--|---|
| Joppa | 82 Joppa Road | Close (dependent on Lothian Buses response) | Close to Portobello Swim Centre, Leisure and Indoor Bowls Centre, Arcades. Propose that Lothian Buses provide contribution to keep these facilities open. Discussion needed around potential for refurbished toilets to replace existing poor quality ones. |
| Juniper Green | 533 Lanark Road | ? | Residential area, relatively low user figures. Propose that Lothian Buses provide contribution to keep these facilities open. |
| London Road | 3 Royal Terrace Gardens | Close | High level of investment needed to bring to reasonable standard, also potential for proposal that Lothian Buses should contribute to maintenance in toilets are retained. |
| Middle Meadow Walk | 1 – 2 Middle Meadow Walk | Close | Requires updating, particularly entrance area which is down some steps. Close proximity to NMS. |
| The Mound | 2 the Mound | Keep | Facility was refurbished in 2013. |
| The Mound | 2 East Princes Street Gardens | Close | Close proximity to number of public facilities, also potential for integration into National Gallery. |
| Nicolson Square | 35 Nicolson Square | Keep | Facility was refurbished in 2013. |
| Pipe Lane | 60 Pipe Lane | Close | Close to Portobello Swim Centre, Leisure and Indoor Bowls Centre, Arcades. Discussion needed around potential for refurbished toilets to replace existing poor quality ones. |
| Ross Band Stand | West Princes Street Gardens | Keep | Facility was refurbished in 2013. |
| Public Convenience | Location | Keep/ Close | Comments |
| St Johns Road | 199/1 St Johns Road | ? (Dependent on Waitrose) | Retail park with facilities is nearby. To investigate whether it would be |

| | | | |
|----------------|-----------------------------|--|--|
| | | planning application) | possible to include planning condition for public conveniences. |
| Taylor Gardens | 178 Great Junction Street | ? | Leith Library toilets are not yet open. |
| West End | West Princes Street Gardens | Keep | Facility was refurbished in 2013. |
| Tollcross | 5 West Tollcross | Close (Dependent on future developments) | Very poor condition, potential for link with planning application for former bingo hall at Fountainbridge. |

1.2 Shift Patterns and Employee Costs

Public Conveniences are managed over two shifts, over the following timescales:

Shift One: 09:00 – 20:39

Shift Two: 10:31 – 22:30

Shift One will open all toilets, carry out cleaning and servicing of facilities and do between 2 – 3 circuits daily to carry out regular cleansing of all the toilets in the city. This service may vary depending on whether there is an emergency and staff are called away from their scheduled route. Shift Two carry out the same duties, and close the toilets at the end of the day.

There are 27 staff employed within the service, as follows:

- 1 Task Force Manager (Grade 7)
- 4 Team Leaders (Grade 5)
- 10 Driver Attendants (Grade 3)
- 10 Toilet Attendants (Grade 3)
- 2 Agency Staff covering Grade 3 vacancies

The 2014/15 Public Conveniences budget is summarised as follows:

- Total employee budget is £720,510
- Total premises budget is £241,584
- Total transport budget is £7,650
- Total supplies and services budget is £33,897

Budget savings will not become immediately available within the 2015/2016 financial year. This is particularly relevant in relation to employee costs, as redeployment of staff into other suitable roles will take place over time, when roles become available. The Open Space Strategy Team will focus on the

identification of potential new roles for staff currently working within the Public Convenience service.

1.3 Marketing and Promotion of Publicly Accessible Toilets

The new Street Furniture contract that is scheduled to be signed within the 2014 calendar year with JCDecaux includes the provision of a physical Wayfinding/ signage system in the City Centre and Leith. This can be used to highlight the location of publicly accessible toilet facilities within this area. This signage system will also be available in a digital format.

The Open Space Strategy Team and Digital Services Team are working on a collaborative project with a web developer in December 2014. This pilot project will result in the development of a prototype for a public toilets app, within a week. This prototype will be developed free of charge for the Council, and will be used to support a business case for the funding of a functioning app that will highlight the locations, opening times, etc. of publicly accessible toilets across the city. The app could also be used to promote events taking place at libraries, Council buildings, and within any businesses that participate in the Community Toilet Scheme.

The Street Furniture contract also includes the provision of digital advertising plinths at 50 bus stops throughout the city centre. The Council has the opportunity to use this facility to promote projects and initiatives, including consultations and in this case, the public toilets app.

1.4 Automatic Public Toilets

The five APT's that are currently located throughout the city were provided and managed by Clear Channel via the Street Furniture contract, which came to an end on 2 August 2014. The locations of the APT's are as follows:

- Grassmarket
- St Andrew Square (two facilities)
- Portobello Promenade
- Foot of Leith Walk

It is expected that JCDecaux will be awarded the new Street Furniture contract, although it is not anticipated that this will include the provision of public toilets. Alternative options are currently being explored by the Council's Corporate Property Team for this provision, including the procurement of an additional company to provide and manage APT's. The Essential Edinburgh BID have held preliminary discussions with the Open Space Strategy Team and emphasised that the loss of the St Andrew Square APT's would have a direct negative impact on the events that are held in the Square, and also the licensing of the coffee shop that has its permanent premises there. There is the potential for a partnership between Essential Edinburgh and the Council to manage these

facilities going forward, however this would require agreement between numerous Council services including Planning, Licensing and Corporate Property.

1.5 Potential Businesses/ Organisations to Contact as Part of a Community Toilet Scheme

As of October 2014, there has been no direct contact made with any businesses about developing a Community Toilet Scheme, although initial discussions have been held with the Greater Grassmarket and Essential Edinburgh Business Improvement Districts. Examples of potential businesses and organisations to consider for this initiative are as follows:

- Marks and Spencer (Princes Street)
- Debenhams (Princes Street)
- John Lewis (St James Centre)
- National Museums Scotland (Chambers Street)
- National Galleries (The Mound)
- Jenners (Princes Street)
- McDonalds (Various Locations)
- Starbucks (Various Locations)
- Costa (Various Locations)
- Caffé Nero (Various Locations)
- Harvey Nichols (St Andrew Square)
- Charitable organisations, such as the [Grassmarket Community Project](#)
- Supermarkets (Various Locations)

Consideration must be given to the kind of incentives we can reasonably offer businesses that participate in the scheme. Examples are financial recompense for consumables, and promotion of businesses via physical infrastructure/ signage and digital services (e.g. the Council's website and public toilets app).

1.6 Developer Contributions – St John's Road and Tollcross

No planning application has been submitted as of yet for the proposed Waitrose supermarket at St John's Road.

A PAN has been approved for a mixed use development at the former Mecca bingo hall (14/03480/PAN) at Fountainbridge, comprised of student accommodation and commercial units. A full application can be expected following 20 November 2014. Planning have advised that they could not confirm whether an additional public convenience would be something they would insist upon as a condition for this application, but the Open Space Strategy Team will liaise with Planning after the full application is submitted.

1.7 People Counters

Approximate 2012 visitor numbers are available from Healthmatic for each of the public conveniences, including the refurbished facilities. If £300,000 (rather than (£600,000) is removed from the Public Conveniences budget, it would be beneficial for the decision making process and defence of any potential closures to have accurate visitor numbers for each facility.

A procurement process would be necessary for this, and potential costs would be in the region of £349 per device. Over 22 locations, this equates to:

- One device per location = £7678
- Two devices per location = £15,356
- Three devices per location = £23,034

1.8 Property Surveys

Condition surveys were carried out on Public Conveniences buildings and facilities in 2009 and 2010, and refurbishment costs were provided at that time. For some facilities, this cost ranged between £80,000 - £100,000.

It would be beneficial to establish more accurate refurbishment figures, in order to inform the decision making process around potential closures of facilities. Corporate Property's Strategic Asset Management Team has offered to provide assistance and carry out condition surveys of Public Conveniences buildings, following the recruitment of Building Surveyors. It is anticipated that these surveys could be carried out in Spring/ Summer 2015.

It may be possible to receive support from Corporate Property's Estates Team, with regards the potential re-use of surplus Public Convenience buildings and potential capital receipts.

Capital funding may be requested in 2016/17 and onwards for the maintenance of Public Convenience buildings, once a strategy/ action plan has been developed and agreed in 2015.

1.9 Community Consultation

Depending on the result of the Council's budget consultation, if the decision is made to retain some public conveniences outwith the city centre then consultation with residents will be necessary to establish which facilities should be closed. If this is carried out prior to the end of the Council's budget consultation, politicians would be better informed about the public perception of the Public Convenience service and the potential for it to be reduced. If a decision is made to remove £600,000 from the service budget, it is anticipated

that all public toilet apart would have to be closed, apart from the refurbished facilities in the city centre.

1.10 Maintenance Contract – Paddle Gates

Costs and additional information about maintenance/ repair programmes for paddle gates at the seven city centre public conveniences have been received from a potential contractor. This is to be reviewed in October/ November 2014, with the potential for a contract to be signed following this. The initial cost given for the repair of the gates is £10,000.

1.11 Equality and Rights Impact Assessments

It will be necessary to carry out an Equality and Rights Impact Assessment on each of the 22 facilities, in order to establish the effect that the loss of each facility would have on various user groups. These assessments will be carried out in collaboration with various community groups, including disability groups. However, it is unlikely that this will be completed before the budget consultation process is concluded.

1.12 Clarity of Budget Consultation Proposals

There is a concern that the proposals in the budget consultation report are not clear with regards the amount of funding the Public Conveniences service is expected to lose. Members of the public could perceive that there will only be a £300,000 saving to be made, when in fact there is the potential to lose £600,000. This could have repercussions following the budget consultation; as if we lose the higher amount then the public may feel that the proposal was misleading.

1.13 Current Work Plan

| Public Conveniences 2014/2015 Monthly Work Plan | Oct 2014 | Nov 2014 | Dec 2014 | Jan 2015 | Feb 2015 | Mar 2015 | Apr 2015 | May 2015 | Jun 2015 | Jul 2015 | Aug 2015 | Sept 2015 | Oct 2015 |
|--|--|--|--|--|--------------------------|----------------------------|--|-------------|-------------|-------------|-------------|--------------|-------------|
| Consultation with Public Conveniences staff and HR | [Orange bar spanning Oct 2014 to Oct 2015] | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Identify staff resources in line with budget proposals | | [Orange bar spanning Nov 2014 to Jan 2015] | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Research of Community Toilet Schemes | [Orange bar spanning Oct 2014 to Feb 2015] | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Equality Impact Assessments | | [Orange bar spanning Nov 2014 to Feb 2015] | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Project Initiation Document | | [Orange bar spanning Nov 2014 to Jan 2015] | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Procurement of People Counters tbc | | | | [Orange bar spanning Jan 2015 to Feb 2015] | | | | | | | | | |
| Public Toilet App Workshop | | | [Orange bar in Dec 2014] | | | | | | | | | | |
| Draft Committee Report for 17 March 2015 Transport and Environment Committee | | | [Orange bar spanning Dec 2014 to Jan 2015] | | | | | | | | | | |
| Promotion of Publicly Accessible Toilets | | | | [Orange bar spanning Jan 2015 to Feb 2015] | | | | | | | | | |
| Assessment of Toilet Buildings by Corporate Property | | | | [Orange bar spanning Jan 2015 to Feb 2015] | | | | | | | | | |
| Budget Consultation Decision – 12 February 2015 | | | | | [Orange bar in Feb 2015] | | | | | | | | |
| Submission of Committee Report to March 2015 Transport and Environment Committee | | | | | | [Orange bar in March 2015] | | | | | | | |
| Implementation of 1 and 3 year strategies | | | | | | | [Orange bar spanning Apr 2015 to Oct 2015] | | | | | | |